Approaches and Methods of Education Policy Analysis

Ahmad Hilman[1], **Adun Rahman**[2], **Dian Widan**[3], **Isnan Rojibillah**[4], **Qiqi Yuliati Zaqiah**[5]

[1] STAI Riyadhul Jannah Subang, Indonesia; ahmadhilman@stairiyadhuljannahsubang.ac.id
[2] STIE Saleh Budiman, Indonesia; adunrahman@gmail.com
[3] UIN SGD Bandung, Indonesia; abiwildan74619@gmail.com
[4] ISBI Bandung, Indonesia; ramymuara@gmail.com
[5] UIN SGD Bandung, Indonesia; qiqiyuliqtizaqiah@uinsg.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Educational policy analysis is a systematic process aimed at understanding, evaluating, and providing recommendations on policies related to the education system and its practices. This article seeks to elaborate on various approaches and methods used in educational policy analysis and their relevance within the context of educational development in Indonesia. The approaches discussed include normative, empirical, and critical approaches, each offering a distinct perspective in assessing policy. The analytical methods employed encompass descriptive, comparative, and evaluative analyses, as well as quantitative and qualitative data-based approaches. This study emphasizes that the effectiveness of educational policy analysis largely depends on the researcher's ability to integrate theoretical approaches with accurate empirical data. Therefore, educational policy analysis functions not only as an evaluation tool but also as a strategic instrument in formulating policies that are more responsive, inclusive, and equitable. The findings are expected to enrich academic discourse and policy practices, particularly in efforts to improve the quality and equity of national education.

Corresponding Author:
Ahmad Hilman
STAI Riyadhul Jannah Subang, Indonesia; ahmadhilman@stairiyadhuljannahsubang.ac.id

1. INTRODUCTION

Education policy is a crucial instrument for directing, regulating, and developing the national education system to align with the nation's development goals. In this context, policy is not merely interpreted as a formal government decision, but rather as a dynamic process involving various actors, values, and social, political, and economic interests. Therefore, education policy analysis is crucial as a means of understanding how policies are formulated, implemented, and evaluated to achieve optimal outcomes for the wider community.

Conceptually, education policy analysis serves as a bridge between policy theory and practice. Through analysis, researchers and policymakers can assess the effectiveness, efficiency, and impact of a policy on various aspects of education, from equitable access and learning quality to the relevance of the

curriculum to the needs of society and the workplace. Thus, policy analysis focuses not only on the final outcome of the policy but also on the processes and social context surrounding it (Dye, 2017; Dunn, 2018).

Over the past two decades, the dynamics of education policy in Indonesia have shown rapid change. Various policies, such as the 2013 Curriculum, Freedom to Learn (Merdeka Belajar), the digital transformation of education, and improving teacher quality through certification programs, demonstrate the government's efforts to adapt to the demands of globalization and the Fourth Industrial Revolution. However, not all of these policies have been effective. Some policies often face obstacles in implementation, such as lack of coordination between institutions, resource imbalances, and resistance from implementers in the field. This situation emphasizes the importance of comprehensive, critical, and evidence-based education policy analysis.

Approaches to education policy analysis vary, from normative approaches oriented toward moral values and principles, to empirical approaches emphasizing data and facts, to critical approaches that highlight the power and ideological dimensions behind a policy. Each approach has its own advantages and limitations. For example, normative approaches can provide an ethical basis for education policy but often pay little attention to empirical reality. Conversely, empirical approaches provide a strong factual picture but sometimes ignore the social and cultural values underlying a policy. Therefore, the integrative use of various approaches is highly recommended in the policy analysis process (Anderson, 2019).

In addition to the approach, policy analysis methods also play a crucial role. Descriptive methods help explain policy conditions and phenomena in detail; comparative methods allow researchers to compare the effectiveness of various policies in different places and times; while evaluative methods assess the extent to which a policy achieves its stated objectives. Furthermore, the simultaneous use of quantitative and qualitative methods provides greater analytical depth, both in terms of numbers and the underlying social context (Patton, 2020).

In academic studies, education policy analysis also holds strategic value in strengthening education governance. Through a scientific and methodological approach, policy analysis can identify weaknesses and potential within the national education system, while also providing recommendations for more targeted improvements. In other words, policy analysis is not only a tool for understanding existing policies but also a means for designing new policies that are more innovative, adaptive, and contextual to the challenges of the times (Subarsono, 2018).

The highly complex educational context in Indonesia, geographically, socially, economically, and culturally, demands a diverse range of policy analyses. Every policy must consider regional characteristics, student needs, and available resource potential. Therefore, a multidimensional approach to education policy analysis is unavoidable. This approach combines perspectives from the economics of education, the sociology of education, the politics of education, and even the philosophy of education to produce a more comprehensive and in-depth analysis.

Therefore, the study of approaches and methods for education policy analysis is highly relevant, especially in efforts to improve the quality of education policy formulation and implementation in Indonesia. A comprehensive understanding of various approaches and methods of analysis will assist policymakers, researchers, and education practitioners in making more rational, equitable, and public-benefit-oriented decisions. Therefore, this paper aims to outline various approaches and methods for education policy analysis and demonstrate their contribution to optimizing the quality of education policy in Indonesia.

2. METHODS

This research uses a qualitative approach with a library research approach. This approach was chosen because studies of approaches and methods for educational policy analysis emphasize conceptual and theoretical analysis rather than field data collection. Through a qualitative approach, researchers seek to deeply understand the concepts, principles, and practices of educational policy analysis from various scientific perspectives developed by experts.

According to Creswell (2018), qualitative research aims to interpret social phenomena based on the meanings individuals or groups assign to a problem. In the context of this research, this meaning refers to how experts and previous researchers understand and apply various approaches and methods to analyzing educational policy. Therefore, this research does not focus on quantitative measurements, but rather on an in-depth and reflective exploration of ideas, arguments, and conceptual constructions.

The criteria for selecting data sources were based on academic credibility, the currency of the information, and relevance to the study context. To ensure the validity and objectivity of the analysis, researchers triangulated data by comparing and critiquing various literature sources from different perspectives.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The Dynamics of Education Policy in Indonesia

Over the past two decades, education policy in Indonesia has undergone significant transformation in terms of paradigm, objectives, and implementation. The global shift toward the digital era and the Fourth Industrial Revolution has encouraged the government to develop policy innovations that are more adaptive to social, technological, and economic changes. Programs such as the 2013 Curriculum, the Guru Penggerak (Driving Teachers) Program, and Merdeka Belajar – Kampus Merdeka (MBKM) represent concrete examples of these efforts.

Nevertheless, these policies are not without challenges and debate. On the one hand, Indonesia's education policies reflect a strong spirit of reform and equity; on the other hand, their implementation often encounters structural obstacles, including limited human resources, regional disparities, and weak inter-institutional coordination. Therefore, education policy analysis is essential to understand policy effectiveness while also identifying inhibiting and supporting factors in its implementation.

The approaches and methods used in education policy analysis in Indonesia must take into account the nation's social, political, and cultural complexity. Education in Indonesia is oriented not only toward academic learning outcomes but also toward character building, moral development, and national values. This implies that education policy must be analyzed multidimensionally, not merely from technical and administrative perspectives, but also from ethical, ideological, and socio-cultural viewpoints.

The Application of the Normative Approach in Education Policy

The normative approach to education policy analysis plays a crucial role in ensuring that policies remain grounded in moral values and public ethics. In the Indonesian context, this approach is closely linked to the values of Pancasila and the principle of social justice.

For example, the Merdeka Belajar policy initiated by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology emphasizes freedom of thought, creativity, and respect for differences in students' abilities and potentials. From a normative perspective, freedom in learning is viewed not merely as an instructional strategy, but as a manifestation of students' fundamental rights to develop according to their natural dispositions.

In Islamic education, this normative approach is also rooted in the values of maqāṣid al-sharī'ah (the objectives of Islamic law), such as the preservation of intellect, life, and moral education. Education policy analysis from this theological perspective strengthens the spiritual dimension of policy, ensuring that education is oriented not only toward cognitive competence but also toward character and moral development.

The Application of Empirical and Evaluative Approaches

Empirical and evaluative approaches are used to assess the extent to which education policies have achieved their intended goals. For instance, teacher certification policies and professional development programs have been evaluated using quantitative data such as Teacher Competency Test (UKG) results and indicators of instructional quality.

Empirical analysis reveals that while teacher certification has succeeded in improving teachers' welfare, it has not fully translated into improved classroom teaching quality. This indicates that

education policy effectiveness cannot be measured solely through administrative or economic indicators, but must also be examined through pedagogical and cultural dimensions.

Evaluative analysis of the Merdeka Belajar policy also shows mixed results. In regions with strong infrastructure and school capacity, the policy has been implemented effectively. However, in remote areas, challenges such as limited technological access, low levels of teachers' digital literacy, and insufficient managerial support remain serious obstacles. Therefore, data-based empirical analysis of education policy must be continuously conducted to adjust implementation strategies to local conditions.

A Critical Approach to Education Policy

The critical approach to education policy analysis highlights power relations and ideological influences underlying policy formulation. In Indonesia, education policies are often shaped by political pressure, economic interests, or global agendas that do not always align with local needs. For example, the global push for educational standardization through policies such as the National Assessment and PISA (Programme for International Student Assessment) has generated criticism. From a critical perspective, such policies risk shifting the orientation of education away from character development toward a narrow focus on academic test scores.

Critical analysis emphasizes that education policy should not merely serve economic or political interests, but must also advocate for social justice and the sustainability of local cultures. This approach is essential to ensure that education policy remains aligned with the interests of students and communities, rather than bureaucratic or capitalistic agendas.

Contextual and Historical Approaches

Contextual and historical analysis helps explain how education policies evolve over time within specific social contexts. For example, education reform in Indonesia following decentralization in 2001 marked a major shift in authority from the central government to local governments.

Education decentralization policies initially aimed to improve efficiency and community participation. However, historical analysis shows that these policies also generated inter-regional disparities due to differences in local government capacity to manage education. Contextual analysis indicates that successful policy implementation depends heavily on the availability of resources and the quality of governance structures at the local level.

This approach underscores the importance of considering social, cultural, and geographical factors in education policy design. In economically disadvantaged regions, for instance, overly technocratic policies tend to be ineffective because they are misaligned with local social realities.

Integrating Multiple Methods of Education Policy Analysis

Comprehensive education policy analysis requires the integration of multiple methods—descriptive, comparative, and evaluative—so that the results not only describe phenomena but also explain causal relationships and propose solutions.

Descriptive methods are useful for understanding policy content and context. Comparative methods provide insights into differences among policies, such as the implementation of the 2013 Curriculum compared to the Kurikulum Merdeka. Evaluative methods, meanwhile, help measure policy effectiveness based on educational performance indicators such as teacher quality, student participation, and learning outcomes.

Furthermore, integrating qualitative and quantitative methods is strongly recommended in modern policy analysis. Statistical data offer empirical validity, while interviews and case studies provide in-depth understanding of realities on the ground. By combining these approaches, education policy analysis becomes more objective while remaining sensitive to social and cultural contexts.

Implications of Education Policy Analysis

The results of education policy analysis indicate that effective policies are those grounded in empirical evidence, rooted in moral values, and formulated through participatory processes. Diverse theoretical and methodological approaches must be applied in an integrated manner to produce policies that are comprehensive and sustainable.

For policymakers, these findings provide a foundation for strengthening policy formulation and evaluation mechanisms that are responsive to changing times. For researchers and academics, education policy analysis offers opportunities to develop policy theories and models that are contextualized within Indonesia's realities.

In the context of Islamic education, this analysis reinforces the importance of integrating Islamic values such as justice ('adl), public welfare (maṣlaḥah), and balance (tawāzun) at every stage of policy analysis. In this way, education policy can produce systems that are not only efficient but also ethical and socially just.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the study and discussion, it can be concluded that education policy analysis is a crucial scientific process for understanding, evaluating, and formulating educational policies that are effective, equitable, and oriented toward the public interest. This analysis functions not only as a tool for evaluation but also as a strategic foundation for designing new policies that are adaptive to social dynamics and national educational needs through the integrated use of normative, empirical, and critical approaches, supported by descriptive, comparative, and evaluative methods based on qualitative and quantitative data. In the Indonesian context, education policy analysis must be contextual in nature, taking into account social, cultural, and geographical diversity, grounded in Pancasila values, and upholding the principles of justice and equity, so that education truly serves as a means of developing knowledgeable, ethical, and civilized human beings in a sustainable manner.

REFERENCES

Anderson, J. E. (2011). Public policymaking: An introduction (7th ed.). Boston: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

Birkland, T. A. (2016). An introduction to the policy process: Theories, concepts, and models of public policy making (4th ed.). New York: Routledge.

Dunn, W. N. (2018). Public policy analysis: An integrated approach (6th ed.). New York: Routledge.

Dye, T. R. (2013). Understanding public policy (14th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.

Fauziyah, N. (2025). Evaluating Inclusive Education Initiatives in Indonesia: From Policy to Practice. EduPij.

Fischer, F., Miller, G. J., & Sidney, M. S. (Eds.). (2007). Handbook of public policy analysis: Theory, politics, and methods. Boca Raton: CRC Press.

Jones, C. O. (1984). An introduction to the study of public policy (3rd ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing.

Nugroho, R. (2018). Public policy: Teori, manajemen, dinamika, analisis, konvergensi, dan kimia kebijakan. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.

Patton, C. V., & Sawicki, D. S. (1993). Basic methods of policy analysis and planning (2nd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Rosidin, A., dkk. (2025). Exploring Educational Policy Innovations and Curriculum: Implementation of Merdeka Belajar in Higher Education. JECS (Journal of Education Culture and Society).

Subarsono, A. G. (2011). Analisis kebijakan publik: Konsep, teori, dan aplikasi. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Tang, Kelvin, dkk. (2024). Climate Change Education in Indonesia's Formal Education: A Policy Analysis. npj Climate Action, 3, 57.

Tilaar, H. A. R., & Nugroho, R. (2009). Kebijakan pendidikan: Pengantar untuk memahami kebijakan pendidikan dan kebijakan publik. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Wahab, S. A. (2014). Analisis kebijakan: Dari formulasi ke penyusunan model-model implementasi kebijakan publik. Malang: Bumi Aksara.

Widiastuti, Ika. (2025). Assessing the Impact of Education Policies in Indonesia: Challenges, Achievement, and Future Direction. Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan, 17(2), 1955–1964.

Winarno, B. (2012). Kebijakan publik: Teori, proses, dan studi kasus. Yogyakarta: CAPS (Center for Academic Publishing Service).

Yehezkel, D. (2019). Policy evaluation and policy learning: Concepts, methods, and applications. New York: Springer.

 "Understanding Policy Changes: Dilemmas of Funding Reform in Indonesia's Higher Education" (2024). Tandfonline.

"Analyzing Digitalization in Education Policy in Indonesia" (2025). Posthumanism Journal.

"A Practical Guide for Policy Analysis: The Eightfold Path to More Effective Problem Solving" (Eugene Bardach & Eric Patashnik, edisi terbaru 2023).

"Education for All: A Systematic Analysis of Equity Policies and Challenges in Indonesia" (2025).

"Assessing the Impact of Digital Learning Policies on Educational …" (2024). International Journal of Educational …

Rahadian, Raditya Bayu. (2023). Analysis of Teachers Management Policy: A Case Study of South Bangka, Indonesia (preprint).

Ngan Sui-Ni. (2023). Peran Pemerintah Pusat dan Daerah dalam Menyediakan Pendidikan Dasar Bermutu untuk Mewujudkan Visi Indonesia 2045.